# 2<sup>ND</sup> FOLLOW-UP REPORT: IMPLEMENTATION OF INITIAL RECOMMENDATIONS

FROM THE EVALUATION OF WAREHOUSING IN KYRGYZSTAN

**Recommended Citation:** de Vasson, Pierre and Burrows, Dave. June 2012. 2<sup>nd</sup> Follow-up Report: Implementation of Initial Recommendations from the Evaluation of Warehousing in Kyrgyzstan. Bethesda, MD, Quality Health Care Project in the Central Asian Republics, Abt Associates Inc.

**Contract Information:** The Quality Health Care Project is funded by the U.S. Agency for International Development under Contract No. AID-176-C-10-00001, beginning September 2010. The Quality Project is implemented by Abt Associates Inc. and its subcontractors AIDS Projects Management Group (APMG), Project HOPE, Scientific Technology and Language Institute (STLI), and Socium Consult.

**Submitted to:** Kairat Davletov

Project Management Specialist, Office of Health and Education

USAID Central Asia Regional Mission

## **DISCLAIMER**

The author's views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) or the United States Government.

# **OBJECTIVES OF THE TRIP**

Provide technical assistance, as requested, to the Global Fund Principle Recipient/Grant Implmentation in Kyrgyzstan (UNDP GIU) and relevant national stakeholders to support implementation of recently-adopted warehousing quality assurance (QA) plan. Specifically:

- I. Strengthen organizational capacity of UNDP PIU Logistics
- 2. Assess previous tender for Third-Party Logistics, provide guidance for successful retendering and next steps
- 3. Set and agree on urgent short term action plan until transition to Third-Party Logistics
- 4. Conduct a post-training assessment of storage conditions and set and agree on an action plan

# **ACTVITIES AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

- A. Assessed the current workload of the single UNDP Logistics specialist and advised UNDP PIU Management to provide one Full-Time-Employee specifically dedicated to Customs Clearance (80%) and inbound logistics coordination (20%). Reviewed the Roles and Responsibilities before advertisement was posted.
- B. Provided new UNDP Logistics specialist with a detailed overview of the situation and coming challenges, explaining the steps that are already being implemented, the agreed strategy for short-term and medium-term tasks, and the long-term vision. Coached him in performing the most urgent tasks for local storage improvement and implementation of the national Guidelines for Storage Management at the Bishkek City AIDS Center.
- C. Undertook to advise UNDP PIU Management in distributing Roles and Responsibilities within the UNDP Logistics team of three people. Provided a draft of these Roles and Responsibilities and a step-by-step chart in Appendix I.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

- I. The draft of Roles and Responsibilities of the three UNDP Logistics specialists should be up-dated, finalized and agreed upon with UNDP PIU Management. These Roles and Responsibilities should be reflected in each ToR of these three individuals.
- 2. These Roles and Responsibilities and step-by-step chart should be stored in the drive of UNDP Logistics and up-dated as needed.
- 3. Detailed short term tasks should be allocated. Medium and long term goals should then be established. Quality Project consultant can facilitate this brainstorming during his September visit.
- 4. UNDP Logistics should first implement the recommendations elaborated in the Follow-Up Report: Implementation of Initial Recommendations provided to UNDP PIU Management in October, 2011. These recommendations should be used as a list of tasks and be implemented one by one where still relevant. This should be followed by implementation of the recommendations in this report.
- 5. It is strongly recommended to UNDP Management to meet every two weeks with the UNDP Logistics specialists in order to monitor closely this critical supporting function, promote efficiency and coordination, ensure that no bottlenecks hinder the timely achievement of the tasks, and that the situation is improving before the summer (high risk season for refrigerated products).
- D. Met with UNDP Logistics to assess the current situation of Third Party Logistics tender. Provided guidance for setting up specifications for a new tender. Evaluated the costs and made sure that the needed requirements would be met, and then received approval from UNDP PIU management.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 1. The most urgent task for the UNDP Logistics specialist is to revise ToR of the past tender as agreed and request retendering to UNDP Procurement. The timeline should be set so that an award can be given as soon as possible before September.
- 2. Visiting potential applicants such as UniHelp might be necessary to explain the new tender and ensure a maximum of applicants and the best competition.
- E. Quality Project assessment found that refrigerated storage at the RAC and Oblast AIDS Centers was facing potential challenges now, most likely during the summer (risky season) and definitely during the introduction of Saliva Rapid testing and the import of other tests (additional refrigerated volume).

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 1. UNDP Logistics should temporarily contract one refrigerated warehouse and one none-refrigerated warehouse and ensure that all incoming goods are stored there instead of being stored at AIDS, TB and Narcology Centers, central and Oblast levels.
- 2. Taking over the current surplus stock of all Centers would be ideal, at least in Bishkek since current storage conditions do not meet minimum standards. This would have a direct financial cost. During this transition, UNDP Logistics would be able to evaluate the quantity of fridges/freezers that are emptied and therefore become useless. Fridges/freezers that are in good condition should then be reallocated to sites in need and equipped with temperature recording/management devices for a) fridges and for b) freezers. Agreement with sites should be found and adequate paperwork should then be processed.
- 3. UNDP Logistics should ensure that Guidelines for Stock and Storeroom Management and stock cards be implemented to these warehouses.
- 4. UNDP Logistics should temporarily contract and start monthly distributions to rayon Sub-Sub-Recipients with refrigerated and non-refrigerated trucks as soon as possible. Prior to this, UNDP Logistics should update and confirm with stakeholder rayon Sub-Sub-Recipients included in the initial list already provided by the Quality Project consultant. Since it would considered a partial roll-out of Third-Party Logistics, UNDP Logistics specialists should work full time on this rolling out that has been prepared on September 29<sup>th</sup>, 2011. Notes are in Appendix 2. Special attention should be allocated to the Stock Replenishment Request tool and the training of Sub-Recipients. The e-form built for HIV tests should gradually be expended to other refrigerated goods and then to non-refrigerated medicines and health products.
- 5. As a medium-term strategy, UNDP Logistics should gradually maximize transportation resource usage by convincing other Sub-Recipients and by bringing in additional volume of goods. We strongly recommend putting extensive effort into TB Centers, and transition transportation and warehousing from their premises to the centralized transportation and warehousing managed by UNDP Logistics.
- UNDP Logistics should maintain a temporary solution (rental) until the award of the Third Party Logistics tender and then ensure complete out-sourcing of warehousing and transportation for refrigerated and non-refrigerated products.
- F. Helped assess a larger temporary non-refrigerated warehouse that could constitute a good transition until the award of the Third Party Logistics tender.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

I. It is recommended that UNDP GIU management initiate a discussion and plan for the long-term solution for a sustainable, modern warehouse (refrigerated and non-refrigerated) in Kyrgyzstan with potential expansion space; first for UNDP PIU and other Inter-Governmental Agencies; and then

- eventually for the Ministry of Health. This warehouse should then be transitioned to MoH control before the mandate of UNDP PIU ends.
- 2. It is recommended that the Quality Project provide the following Technical Assistance:
  - a) Develop national Guidelines for Cold/Frozen chain, describe the Roles and Responsibilities of a Cold Chain Rep. in detail, set up a Cold Chain incident reporting tool, provide guidance in adequate equipment and train UNDP Logistics.
  - b) Inform Kyrgyzstan Inter-Governmental Agencies of the opportunity to use UNDP GIU's centralized warehousing and distribution for their own medicine and health products, and gather their own specifications.
  - c) Propose to these Inter-Governmental Agencies a long term solution consisting of building or renovating a warehouse that would be transferred to the Kyrgyz Ministry of Health, and eventually expanded.
  - d) Draft requirements and coordinate a potential request for a Health System Strengthening grant to the Global Fund.
- G. Rapidly assessed the impact of the training on *Guidelines for Stock and Storage Management* in several AIDS Centers and found the following:
  - a. Few sites had at hand the *Guidelines for Stock and Storage Management*. Some informed us that they were not trained. Other claimed that they did not receive the *Guidelines* during the training.
  - b. Few AIDS centers had posted up the *do's and don'ts* laminated signs. None were using stock cards and or providing new temperature logs. The main reason for this was that the Guidelines were not approved by the Ministry of Health and were not replacing current tools.
  - c. Some sites had developed a plan for weekly storeroom cleaning.
  - d. In order to store medicines in good condition at the consultation room level, medicine cabinets should be provided for every consultation room that dispenses medicines. The best equipment was found at the Bishkek City AIDS Center: this is a professional medicine cabinet (pictures are enclosed in Appendix 2). Quantification should be performed during scheduled visits, the cost of this equipment should be budgeted and when approved, procured.
  - e. After the storage evaluations were performed in June 2011, UNDP GIU budgeted \$153,000 USD for new equipment and renovation. Eight new professional fridges (including voltage stabilizators) were the only equipment distributed to AIDS sites. Other equipment and items were not purchased or distributed to sites.
- H. UNDP Logistics agreed that the previous evaluation and training had a rather minimal impact at the local level. Developed a plan for UNDP Logistics staff to 1) visit AIDS Centers, and review and directly implement as many of the Guidelines as possible (post Do's and Don'ts, etc.), install equipment when possible, 2) select storerooms and come to an agreement with directors of AIDS Centers, 3) evaluate and log renovation needs and current/missing equipment in detail. This plan will be executed by September when the Quality Project consultant will return to perform the overall evaluation.

# **RECOMMENDATIONS**

It is recommended that UNDP Logistics:

1. Procure necessary equipment (such as digital recording hygrometer/thermometers for rooms, two digital recording thermometers with probes for fridge/freezer, etc. with Russian user's manual) from

- the approved budget. Insert this user's manual in the updated national Guidelines for Stock and Storage Management that would be provided to sites.
- 2. Visit AIDS centers according to an agreed schedule and prioritized with the most remote, most urgent, and highest volume sites.
- 3. Provide an updated national Guidelines for Stock and Storage Management and associated tools, implement them, install right away some of the equipment and update signs and logs. Make sure that UNDP Logistics keeps a log of visits, what has been done, all equipment provided, and next steps to be implemented.
- 4. Provide guidance and reach a consensus with the Directors of AIDS Centers on proper/adequate storeroom selection. This room should be as close as possible (same floor, same corridor) to the consultation rooms. It should be also taken into consideration that deliveries will be monthly, and stock on hand will be only for use on site. Therefore, stock on hand will be minimal.
- 5. Evaluate and log renovation needs in detail and current/missing equipment. A template including the first example can be found in Appendix 3.
- 6. As soon as possible, set and start the tender of renovation contract with UNDP Procurement
- 7. Discuss and agree upon an additional renovation budget for 2013 and later for the remaining sites with UNDP Management and UNDP Procurement.
- I. The Guidelines for Stock and Storeroom Management are not currently approved by the MoH. It is planned to become approved via General Guidance and Tool Package for Saliva testing.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 1. UNDP Logistics should regularly update the Guidelines for Stock and Storage Management and make sure that the newest version is available on UNDP Logistics "D: drive".
- 2. UNDP Logistics should monitor MoH's approval of Guidelines for Stock and Storage Management with UNDP VCRT rep.; make sure that minimal changes are imposed and duplicate forms, logs, etc. are up-to-date with the ones in the Guidelines for Stock and Storage Management that meet the international standards. When approved, UNDP Logistics should then set up visit schedules for 1) routine control and 2) surprise control.

# RECOMMENDED NEXT STEPS

- I. Follow-up support should be provided to UNDP Logistics to strengthen an efficient organisation and task distribution.
- 2. Further support should be provided to UNDP Logistics and Procurement for successful tender, contracting, implementing and transitioning to Third-Party Logistics.
- 3. Continuing support should be provided to develop and expand a robust Stock Replenishment Request system and procedure for refrigerated and non-refrigerated goods for the three diseases.
- 4. Support should be provided to organize strong M&E team, system, procedures, and tools with new data set provided by the Third-Party Logistics and support 4 levels of indicators:
  - a. operational indictors at the SR level,
  - b. decision-making indictors at the PR level,
  - c. indictors for reports to CCM,
  - d. indictors for reports to GFATM.

5.	Initial technical assistance should be provided to move towards consensual decision making for a long-term warehousing solution in Kyrgyzstan
	7.6/2000

# APPENDIX A: DRAFT ROLES & RESPONSIBILITIES

# WITH STEP-BY-STEP CHART FOR UNDP LOGISTICS TEAM

		UNDP Logistics	Third-Party Logistics 1) Inbound transportation 2) Warehousing 3) Outbound transportation	Sub-Recipients, Sub-Sub-Recipients	
nd Logistics	Customs Gearance ( <mark>by customs clearance derk)</mark>	1) Receives schedule of shipments from UNDP Procurement and schedules own workload 2) Liaises with fret forwarder, coordinates inbound logistics to customs terminals, informs UNDP Logistics and Third-Party Logistics of inbound shipment and ensures space at the central warehouse and transportation availability 3) controls shipment documentation for clearance from the suppliers 4) Prepares and sends letters, requests and collects permission documents with the state bodies 5) Follows procedures of customs clearance 6) Receives goods at the customs terminal and manages storage durations. 7) Controls thoroughly goods conditions, quantity and products against <i>Purchase Order</i> 8) Receives permission documents for the usage of medical goods after customs clearance.			
punoquI	Inbound Transportation (by Nurzat)	9) Coordinates inbound logistics to central warehouse with Third-Party Logistics, controls adequate transportation conditions and takes decision in case of temperature excursion  11a) For refrigerated products, controls immediately temperature	10) Provides refrigerated/non- refrigerated transportation from customs terminals to central warehouses and manpower to off load into central warehouse		
	T punoqul <mark>(d)</mark>	recording/monitoring device, liaises with fret forwarder/manufacturer in case of temperature excursion  11b) For HIV Tests, informs QC Lab rep. of new shipment and coordinates QC tests  00) Monitors and evaluates good performance of Third-Party Logistics			

Central Stock and Storage Management	anagement	12) Coordinates with warehouse staff on storage of incoming goods, replenishing and arranging according to product locations and expiration dates in the refrigerated and non- refrigerated warehouses 14) Records goods received on stock cards 15) Records received goods in stock record book and in stock management software  16) Performs routine duties on stock and storage according to national Guidelines For Storage Management 17) Periodically controls physical inventory			
	Central Stock and Storage Management (by Nurzat)	5) Receives and controls Stock Replenishment Requests 6) Forwards Stock Replenishment Requests to Third-Party Logistics before the first (1) work day of the second week of the month (Monday 6am)  9) Records products dispensed on stock cards 10) Records products dispensed in stock record book and in stock management software	7) Processes <i>Stock Replenishment Requests</i> on the first (1) work day of the second week of the month (Monday) 8) Picks-up, packs according to Sub-Recipients and loads in delivery sequence into truck	1) Evaluates needs for the coming one (1) month 2) Completes the Stock Replenishment Request form or receives it from Sub-Sub-Recipient 3) Determines whether quantity and products are realistic 4) Reports to UNDP before cut-off time (last work day of the first week of the month, Friday 5pm)	Local Stock Replenishment Requesting
		00) Monitors and evaluates good performance of Third-Party Logistics			
Outbound Logistics	Outbound Transportation ( <mark>by Urmat)</mark>	11) Liaises with Third-Party Logistics, controls adequate transportation condition and takes decision in case of temperature excursion 12) Keeps updated routes and contact information of Sub-Recipients and informs Third-Party Logistics in case of changes  00) Monitors and evaluates good performance of Third-Party Logistics	9) Transports within the week from Tuesday (of the second week) onward according to the established routes 10) Ensures adequate transportation condition for refrigerated and non- refrigerated goods 11) Informs Sub-Recipients by phone when approaching site 12) Off loads in the storeroom of the sites and hands out packing slip to storeroom keeper for signature		

Local Stock and Storage Management	Control of Local Stock and Storage Management (by Urmat)	14) Receives questions/concerns from Sub-Recipients and works with Third-Party Logistics to solve them  16) Receives questions/concerns from Sub-Recipients and liaises with Third-Party Logistics to solve them  17) Routinely ensures that Sub-Recipients apply national <i>Guidelines For Storage and Stock Management</i> and meet international standards  00) Monitors and evaluates good performance of Third-Party Logistics  00) Evaluates and renovates/equips storeroom, liaises with UNDP Procurement for budget and follow up storage conditions  00) Keeps equipment lists by sites and updates when needed  00) Trains routinely storeroom keeper and supervisor  00) Controls routinely that Sub-Recipients implement and follow national <i>Guidelines For Storage and Stock Management</i>	13) Receives deliveries from Third-Party Logistics 14) Controls quickly quantity and products against Stock Replenishment Request 15) Signs packing slip from Third-Party Logistics 16) Controls thoroughly quantity and products against Stock Replenishment Request 17) Replenishes and arranges according to product locations and expiration dates in the fridge or the shelves 18) Records products received on stock cards 19) Records received products in stock record book 20) Periodically controls physical inventory 21) Dispenses to patients/customers or cabinets 22) Records products dispensed on stock cards 23) Records products dispensed in stock record book 24) Reports to UNDP Logistics any concerns	Local Stock and Storage Management
Reverse Logistics	Cold Chain Transportation (TBD)	00) Provides guidance on Cold Chain, provides Cold Chain equipment to Sub-Recipients and leads national <i>Guidelines for Cold Chain</i> 00) Answers questions/concerns on Cold Chain 00) Collects Cold Chain Incident reports and takes action		

# APPENDIX B : ADEQUATE MEDICINE CABINET (IN SPACE AND MATERIAL)

# **FOUND AT BISHKEK CITY AIDS CENTER**

# Characteristics:

- 2m high x 0.5m wide x 0.5m deep
- Metal
- Upper section with a glass door; lower section with a solid door





# APPENDIX C : EVALUATION OF STOREROOM+ROOM WITH FRIDGE/FREEZER RENOVATION NEED

City	Bishkek				
Facility & date of visit	Republican AIDS Center		Bishkek City AIDS Center (visit	Bishkek City AIDS Center (visited on 07 June 2012)	
Type of products stored	Non refrigerated goods	Refrigerated goods	Non refrigerated goods	Refrigerated goods	
Past/current rooms: Localisation rationale:			In 1 refuse room + 2 cabinets in 1 dispensing room	2 rooms in lab, 1 consultation room -3 -	
Future room : Concensus on selection Story level :			New unused room Yes, with AIDS Center director Ground floor,	Same Yes Ground floor	
Localisation rationale : Activity there for long term ?			Facing 4 consultation room Yes	In Lab Yes	
Size (L x W x H) meters: Easy accessibility for delivery ?			2,5m × 4m × 2,5m high Yes, ground floor	-	
Interior conditions Ceiling: Floor:			Good, newly renovated - -	Good	
Walls: Hermetic door:			- Open a new door and close old one		
Windows: Sunlight control:			-		
Other major work : Other minor work :			Open a new door and close old one Create a secured door + open new ventilation. Cut current tubs.		
Electricity: Sufficient lights: Presence of fridge & # ?			Yes Yes No		
Security: Alarm: Fire extinguisher			None Needed Needed		
Place next to entering door ? Secured windows: Secured door:			Needed - Needed		
Hygrometer/Thermometer: in storeroom In consultation room			Needed: I for I storeroom Needed: 4 for 4 consultation room	Needed, 3 for 3 rooms	
Air conditioner: Heater:			-	Needed, 3 for 3 rooms ? (TBD)	
Medicine cabinet needed in consultation			Yes, 2 cabinets for 2 remaing rooms	-	

r: Shelving needed: # of 2m x 2m x 0,50m Sketch (place door/window) & shelves Installed stock cards?		Yes 3 units	Not
Installed stock cards ? Installed dos & donts ? Installed temperature logging ?		Yes, on 2 medicine cabinets Not	Yes, on 2 fridges Not
COLD CHAIN			
Fridges & freezers & localisation Freezer/fridge: current/future #* Type: kitchen or professional			Yes Lab : 2 new kitchen Hitachi freezer/fridge by KfG, 1 old kichen freezer/fridge Consultation : 1 old kichen freezer/fridge
Freezers: current/future #* Type: kitchen or professional			-
# to be reallocated : # of stabilizer ?			0 0
Fridge/freezer temperature monitoring: Current situation: Temperature data logger for each freezer/ fridge? Need:			2 temp devices for 4 machines, not recording. Needed: 8 temperature data loggers
Cold chain equipement: Transportation equipement? Temperature data logger? Needed			2 blue picknick bag + ice packs non UNDP No termometer 2 UNDP Mobicool + 2 T° data logger
Sketch (place door/window)			
Remarks:		Storeroom almost ready, no renovation Only opening new door on corridor + closing old one + create a door. Install shelves	T° data logger should be provided 3 air conditionners for 3 fridge rooms : freezer temperature varies since room temperature varies.

<sup>\*</sup> After reduction of stock by monthly deliveries & direct distribution

# APPENDIX D: SUGGESTIONS TO UNDP LOGISTICS TEAM

#### **Current Situation**

The workload evaluation was made on May 24, one day after the arrival of the Quality Project consultant to Kyrgyzstan. This evaluation showed that Nurzat Sheishenov was working on customs clearance for approximately 80% of the time and on logistical issues for 20% of the time (searching and selecting non-refrigerated warehouse, delivering to temporary warehouse, coordinating outbound logistics to sub and sub-sub recipients). Nurzat was the only team member managing UNDP GIU's Logistics.

Furthermore, a report from June 8th, 2011 from a previous trip which included a comprehensive to-do list following a training on the national *Guidelines for Management of Stock, Storeroom, Fridge, Freezer and Cabinet* had still not been implemented twelve months later. It was evident that Nurzat was unable to allocate sufficient time to working on important logistics issues and solutions. Budgets for renovation and equipment were established. The first tender for outsourcing warehousing and transportation was not fully successful. But the warehousing and transportation situation of the UNDP has not improved enough since the first evaluation and the subsequent training. Instead of working on logistics, Nurzat works on clearing customs, which entails working bureaucratic administration offices in search of signatures and stamps. Nevertheless, this work is very important since it is the first step to receiving stock.

# Suggested Recommendation for UNDP GIU Organizational Management

Nurzat's work on customs clearance is beneath his high skill level and salary. Furthermore, Nurzat mentioned searching for a more exciting position and possibly quitting the UNDP. Leaving customs clearance to a well-trained clerk with a lower salary under Nurzat's supervision would be a better use of resources. The Quality Project consultant recommended to the UNDP GIU Management to create this position. Later, the idea was well-received by Nurzat.

The Quality Project consultant strongly believes that the warehouse and transportation situation has somewhat worsened since June 2011. New activities will be rolled-out in September, such as the Saliva Rapid Test which will add up to 6 m³ of refrigerated products to the pipeline. And no constant or periodic refrigerated warehouse and transportation route exists for current and future cold chain activity to date. *Oblast* AIDS centers' storage space is still maxed-out. Renovation of storerooms and implementation of the national *Guidelines* have not really begun. In conclusion, the UNDP Logistics team will have to find, award and transfer warehousing and transportation to a Third-Party Logistics, UNDP Logistics now needs to manage a new crisis before the summer. This is critical.

The Quality Project consultant further strongly recommended creating a second position for a Logistics specialist to ensure improvement and the implementation of new tasks. The tasks listed in June 2011's Follow-Up Report: Implementation of Initial Recommendations and June 2012's 2nd Follow-Up Report: Implementation of Initial Recommendations do justify the need for two people working on Logistics.

The UNDP must implement urgent recommendations in order to manage the refrigerated goods crisis before and during the summer. Following this, they must prepare and transition activities to the Third-Party Logistics, then coordinate centralized warehousing and transportation to the *rayon* level for all refrigerated goods. Lastly, the UNDP should expand warehousing and transportation to non-refrigerated goods, this would have to include TB products, etc., as listed in both reports.

We therefore believe that such a large and comprehensive list of tasks would be best supported by the above recommended organisation in the short term. For a long term solution, responsibilities such as the Cold Chain representative and the establishment of a sustainable and permanent warehouse in Kyrgyzstan should be transferred to the Logistics Team after logistics are well established.